City of Carroll

112 E. 5th Street Carroll, Iowa 51401-2799 (712) 792-1000 FAX: (712) 792-0139

MEMO TO: Honorable Mayor and City Council Members

FROM: Mike Pogge-Weaver, City Manager MSP-W

DATE: October 10, 2019

SUBJECT: Carroll Public Library Furniture Fixtures and Equipment (FFE) Package
- Report of Bid Opening
- Award of Bid

On October 2, 2019, bids for the FFE related to the Carroll Public Library Project were received, opened, and tabulated. The bid package included 15 sections. Bids are to be awarded to the lowest responsive bid for each section. Section 14 is still being reviewed so it is excluded at this time and will be considered at a future date. A total of seven bids were received for the various sections. Attached is a summary of the bids for all of the sections.

All bids received were reviewed for compliance with specifications and totals verified. Following review, it was determined that the lowest responsive bid for each section is as follows:

Section	Responsive Low Bid	Vendor
Section 8 - 3Branch	$4,717.00	LFI
Section 9 - Allermuir	$8,242.00	Saxton
Section 10 - Arcadia	$8,999.88	Pigott
Section 11- BCI	$5,738.92	Storey Kenworthy
Section 12 - Bernhardt	$16,575.04	Storey Kenworthy
Section 13 - Falcon	$2,002.04	Pigott
Section 14 - Herman Miller	Still Under Review	
Section 15 - IDEON	$7,525.50	Stone Printing
Section 16 - IOA	$1,869.40	Stone Printing
Section 17 - Keilhauer	$4,592.14	Storey Kenworthy
Section 18 - Knoll	$3,475.49	Saxton
Section 19 - OFS	$6,089.52	Saxton
Section 20 - Peter Pepper	$3,944.63	Storey Kenworthy
Section 21 - Sixinch	$3,823.41	Pigott
Section 22 – Steelcase	$14,121.38	Workspace
Grand Total	$ 91,716.35	

Attached to this memo is a letter from OPN Architects discussing the bid opening and their recommendation. OPN is recommending the City reject three of the bids and go with the second low bidder in these cases.

Currently the furniture budget for the Library is as follows:

Shelving:	$135,913.00	(Actual cost)
End Panels:	$23,000.00	(OPN suggested to account for edits in design development)
Furniture Except Sec 14:	$91,716.35	(Actual cost)
Furniture for Section 14:	$95,000.00	(Estimated Cost)
TOTAL:	$ 345,629.35	

The budget for the library shelving and furniture had a range of $388,928 to $435,072; which based on the current cost and cost estimates is $43,298.65 under budget.

RECOMMENDATION: Mayor and City Council consideration and approval of bids for the Carroll Public Library Furniture Fixtures and Equipment awarding Section 8 to Library Furniture International in the amount of $4,717.00; Sections 9, 18 and 19 to Saxton in the amount of $17,807.01; Section 10, 13, and 21 to Pigott of Des Moines in the amount of $14,825.33; Section 11, 12, 17, and 20 to Storey Kenworthy in the amount of $30,850.73; Section 15 and 16 to Stone Printing in the amount of $9,394.90; and Section 22 to Workspace in the amount of $14,121.38.

OPN ARCHITECTS

Cedar Rapids
200 Fifth Avenue SE Ste. 201
Cedar Rapids, Iowa 52401
(319) 363-6018

Des Moines
100 Court Avenue Ste. 100
Des Moines, Iowa 50309
(515) 309-0722

Iowa City
24 ½ S. Clinton Street Ste. 1
Iowa City, Iowa 52240
(319) 363-6018

Madison
301 N. Broom Street Ste. 100
Madison, Wisconsin 53703
(608) 819-0260

opnarchitects.com

To: City of Carroll, 510 N. Carroll Street, Ste. 2, Carroll, Iowa 51401

Date: October 10, 2019

City of Carroll: Upon reviewing the bid responses submitted for the above referenced project, OPN Architects recommends the City of Carroll accept the following bid submissions per section, as follows:

Section 8 – 3Branch: LFI

Note: Stone Printing was the apparent low bidder, however, we feel the submitted alternate product did not meet the expectations of the product specified as the basis-of-design for the following reasons; finish and size of table top is unclear – the product submitted by Stone is a height adjustable table base. OPN fears a tabletop was not included in the bid and therefore would ultimately increase the price to be more than the LFI bid.

Section 9 – Allermuir: Saxton

Section 10 - Arcadia: Piggot

Note: Stone Printing was the apparent low bidder, however, we feel the submitted alternate product did not meet the expectations of the product specified as the basis-of-design for the following reasons; Stone Printing could not guarantee that the dimensions shown on specifications would match, nor could they guarantee the fabrics specified would be approved for use on the proposed product. OPN does not feel the proposed product achieves the same aesthetic as specified product.

Section 11 – BCI: Storey Kenworthy

Section 12 - Bernhardt: Storey Kenworthy

Note: Stone Printing was the apparent low bidder, however, they only submitted an alternate for 1 of 2 chairs specified in Section 12. Therefore, it is a partial submittal.

Section 13 - Falcon: Pigott

Section 14 – Herman Miller* to be awarded at a later date

Section 15 - IDEON: Stone Printing Office Supply

OPN ARCHITECTS

Section 16 - IOA: Stone Printing Office Supply

Section 17 - Keilhauer: Storey Kenworthy

Section 18 – Knoll: Saxton

Section 19 – OFS: Saxton

Section 20 – Peter Pepper: Storey Kenworthy

Section 21 – Sixinch: Piggot

Section 22 – Steelcase: Workspace

OPN Architects is pleased to offer this recommendation and is looking forward to seeing through the completion of the Library Interior Furnishings project for the City of Carroll. Please feel free to contact me with any questions.

Sincerely,

Mindy Sorg

Contract Interior Designer, on behalf of OPN ARCHITECTS, INC.

BID TABULATION RESULTS

OPN ARCHITECTS
301 N. Broom Street #100
Madison, WI 53703

Project: Carroll Public Library
Location: Carroll, IA
Project #: 17842001
Issue Date: September 16, 2016

Bidder	Section 08 3Branch	Section 09 Allermuir	Section 10 Arcadia	Section 11 BCI	Section 12 Bernhardt	Section 13 Falcon	Section 15 IDEON	Section 16 IOA	Section 17 Keilhauer	Section 18 Knoll	Section 19 OFS	Section 20 Peter Pepper	Section 21 Sixinch	Section 22 Steelcase
Piggot	NO BID	NO BID	$8,999.88	NO BID	NO BID	$2,002.04	NO BID	NO BID	NO BID	NO BID	NO BID	NO BID	$3,823.41	NO BID
LFI	$4,717.00	NO BID	NO BID	NO BID	NO BID	NO BID	NO BID	NO BID	NO BID	NO BID	NO BID	NO BID	NO BID	NO BID
Saxton	NO BID	$8,242.00	NO BID	NO BID	NO BID	NO BID	NO BID	NO BID	NO BID	$3,475.49	$6,089.52	NO BID	NO BID	NO BID
Stone Printing	$3,053.48	NO BID	$6,474.72	NO BID	$10,343.70	NO BID	$7,525.50	$1,869.40	NO BID	NO BID	$7,505.74	$4,033.02	NO BID	NO BID
Storey Kenworthy	NO BID	NO BID	NO BID	$5,738.92	$16,575.04	NO BID	$7,540.16	NO BID	$4,592.14	NO BID	$6,851.85	$3,944.63	NO BID	NO BID
Triplett	NO BID	NO BID	NO BID	NO BID	NO BID	NO BID	NO BID	NO BID	NO BID	NO BID	NO BID	NO BID	$4,346.69	NO BID
Workspace	NO BID	NO BID	NO BID	NO BID	NO BID	NO BID	$8,467.20	NO BID	NO BID	NO BID	NO BID	NO BID	NO BID	$14,121.38

Alternate Submitted
Partial Section Submitted
ONP Recommended Award

SUGGESTED BID AWARDS	$4,717.00	$8,242.00	$8,999.88	$5,738.92	$16,575.04	$2,002.04	$7,525.50	$1,869.40	$4,592.14	$3,475.49	$6,089.52	$3,944.63	$3,823.41	$14,121.38
													TOTAL	$91,716.35